



# **French Teleradiology Guidelines for Patient Care**

**Prof Alain Rahmouni, Dr Jean-Philippe Masson**

Société Française de Radiologie

Conseil Professionnel de Radiologie

Conseil National de l'Ordre des Médecins

# Objectifs pedagogiques obligatoires sites SFR et G4

- Référentiel metier+
- Charte teleradiologie G4/CNOM+
- CEOM-telemedecine
- Tele-imagerie SNITEM/G4

# Objectifs pedagogiques facultatifs; pour en savoir plus...

J Am Coll Radiol. 2013 Aug;10(8):575-85. doi: 10.1016/j.jacr.2013.03.018. Epub 2013 May 17.

---

## **ACR white paper on teleradiology practice: a report from the Task Force on Teleradiology Practice.**

Silva E 3rd<sup>1</sup>, Breslau J, Barr RM, Liebscher LA, Bohl M, Hoffman T, Boland GW, Sherry C, Kim W, Shah SS, Tilkin M.

### **Author information**

### **Abstract**

**Teleradiology** services are now embedded into the workflow of many radiology practices in the United States, driven largely by an expanding corporate model of services. This has brought opportunities and challenges to both providers and recipients of **teleradiology** services and has heightened the need to create best-practice guidelines for **teleradiology** to ensure patient primacy. To this end, the **ACR** Task Force on **Teleradiology** Practice has created this white paper to update the prior **ACR** communication on **teleradiology** and discuss the current and possible future state of **teleradiology** in the United States. This white paper proposes comprehensive best-

# Objectifs pedagogiques facultatifs; pour en savoir plus...

Insights Imaging (2014) 5:1–8  
DOI 10.1007/s13244-013-0307-z

STATEMENT

## ESR white paper on teleradiology: an update from the teleradiology subgroup

European Society of Radiology (ESR)

Received: 9 December 2013 / Accepted: 10 December 2013 / Published online: 18 January 2014  
© The Author(s) 2014. This article is published with open access at Springerlink.com

### Abstract

**Background** Teleradiology services are increasingly integrated into the workflow of radiological departments in EU-member states.

**Methods** The current technological possibilities and European political agenda are both opening the way for cross-border telemedicine services including teleradiology.

**Results** This is bringing new opportunities for both users and providers of teleradiology services, which has led to the idea of producing an updated version of earlier ESR statements and communications on teleradiology. For this purpose the e-Health and Informatics subcommittee established a Teleradiology subgroup.

**Conclusion** This white paper proposes comprehensive best-practice guidelines for teleradiology usage, focussing on services within the European Union, as prepared by the members

**Keywords** Teleradiology · Teleradiologist · Teleradiology company · Quality of care · Regulatory issues · Patient primacy · Technology · European community · Outsourcing

### Introduction

This White Paper is intended as an update of the document “Teleradiology in the European Union-White Paper”, issued by the European Society of Radiology (ESR) in 2006 [1]. The process of digitisation is progressing quickly within health care and the European political agenda is firmly embracing this digital revolution [2]. Telemedicine and e-Health services are being promoted on a pan-European level, causing major changes in European legislation. These evolutions impelled the e-Health and Informatics subcommittee of the ESR to



Secrétaire général  
Jean-Pierre Pruvo

Secrétaires généraux adjoints  
Louis Boyer  
Charles-André Cuenod  
Jean-François Méder  
Valérie Vilgrain

Président  
Denis Krausé

Président sortant  
Laurent Verzaux

Trésorière  
Marie-France Bellin

Prof. Lorenzo Bonomo  
ESR President

Copy:  
Prof. Robert Hermans  
Insights into Imaging – Editor-in-chief

Paris, April 22, 2014

Object: ESR white paper on teleradiology

Dear Prof. Bonomo, President of the ESR,

The SFR board was astounded by the publication of the « ESR white paper on teleradiology » in Insights into Imaging because the content of this paper is at the opposite of the SFR recommendations to develop high level teleradiology.

# Plan

- Introduction, radiology is medicine
- The profession of radiologist in France
- The french Teleradiology Charter
- Results of french educational policy on teleradiology
- Conclusions, telemedicine is not e-commerce

# Introduction

- 1897, Tenon Hospital, Paris: first Department of Radiology, Antoine Béclère
- 1899, Béclère believed that hospital radiology departments should be under the control of a physician
- Since that time, it is admitted worldwide that radiology is a medical specialty



# Introduction, teleradiology white papers and guidelines

- All publications on teleradiology feel the need to repeat that teleradiology is a medical act
- Could teleradiology be considered as a non-medical act?
- The response to this question will depend on the definition of the radiological (medical) act; this definition will depend not only on the skills of the radiologist but also on the duties he will have to assume



# The profession of radiologist in France



Mission Évaluation  
des compétences  
professionnelles  
des métiers de la santé

Conseil  
professionnel  
de la radiologie  
médicale française

OCTOBRE 2010

## RÉFÉRENTIEL MÉTIER ET COMPÉTENCES DU MÉDECIN RADIOLOGUE



MINISTÈRE DE LA SANTÉ  
RZ 062 201013

- Profession and skills framework of the radiologist: this text is an exhaustive description of the role, duties and skills of a radiologist with several examples
- This document is issued by the ministry of health
- Teleradiology recommendations
- Teleradiology charter for educational purpose

# The profession of radiologist in France, main rules

- The French National Medical Council (Conseil National de l'Ordre des Médecins) authorizes radiology practice according to recognized diplomas and within the rules of the deontology code (code de déontologie)
- Each radiological act is defined by a National State Agency (Caisse Nationale d'Assurance Maladie) according to a national and common classification
- Each radiological act is associated to a defined national fee
- Teleradiology is by law a medical act

# French teleradiology charter

- A lot of common viewpoints with ACR and ESR white papers
- Proposal for common and shared new items

## French Teleradiology Charter

- Remote image transmission on a technical level, and remote reading by a teleradiologist do not sum up the complete teleradiology medical act

## Proposed items

Teleradiology recommendations should not forget

- The important need of dialogue between the radiologist and the patient
- The role of the radiologist in the management of a department/structure of radiology: machines, technologists and the organization of the patient path care

## French Teleradiology Charter 2014

- Teleradiology should be clearly distinguished from remote reading of images
- There are other medical processes in the duties of a radiologist
- Before reading images: validation, imaging protocols etc
- Managerial processes: radiographers skills, team management, adapted machines, appointment processes
- Communication with the patient, the clinician
- Complementary diagnostic or interventional radiology as well as multidisciplinary (including radiologist) meetings/decisions

## Proposed items

- A teleradiologist cannot be only defined as a physician providing a reading service

## **French Teleradiology Charter 2014**

- Teleradiology must offer high quality radiological medicine via a teleradiologist
- The use of teleradiology is only justified in the interest of the patient if radiological care by a radiologist located nearby the patient is not possible; it must be justified and integrated into the organization of the care (local or regional)

## **Proposed items**

- Emergency situations need emergency reports instead of preliminary reads

## French Teleradiology Charter 2014

- The use of teleradiology is only justified in the interest of the patient if radiological care by a radiologist located nearby the patient is not possible; it must be justified and integrated into the organization of the care (local or regional)
- Teleradiology should promote exchanges of knowledge and knowhow among the radiologists
- Teleradiology must not be used to justify the acquisition or renewal of imaging facilities without a radiologist.

## Proposed items

- Teleradiology should be organized with the « on source team » including radiologists, technicians and clinicians

## French Teleradiology Charter 2014

- The goal of the profession and skills framework as well as the teleradiology charter are (1) to develop the use of teleradiology at a local (or « regional ») level between all radiologists, (2) to prevent radiologists from legal issues, (3) to ensure ethics and quality of care
- Telemedicine is not e-commerce but clinical medicine



## Proposed items

- National recommendations in European countries are important and complementary to « white papers » due to the differences in the nation-based medical organizations
- Fear of down reimbursements for radiology through price competition is unjustified when local/regional radiologists are responsible for territorial patient care
- Teleradiology should not be e-commerce



# Other proposals

- Radioprotection rules and the responsibility of the teleradiologist in this topic: the radiographer acquiring Xrays/CT images is acting under the responsibility of the teleradiologist.
- Tele expertise (examples: complex cases or second mammogram reading) and some specific medical assistance (islands, armed forces etc) only should be performed on a supra local/regional basis
- The regulatory rules for teleradiology and radiology should be identical (not EU regulation)
- French radiologists do not agree with the Licensing statement which stipulates that the legislation of the teleradiologist's member state should be applied to teleradiology in Europe instead of the legislation of the patient's member state.
- More than 5 billions people in the world have no access to radiologists. Europe has among the best radiologists in the world: second advice and expert opinion?

# Results of our educational charter-based actions

- Legal insurance for teleradiologists when they respect the Charter
- In France, teleradiology is the first application of telemedicine (>700) mainly on a local basis
- It allows increased communication between radiologists (private and hospital-based) with emerging common organizations
- **An emerging territorial organization using all available imaging tools including teleradiology when needed;** in the close future, public/private imaging joint ventures called territorial imaging centers

# Conclusions

- Regulatory and economical rules must adapt to protect patients from low quality care; the role of radiologists must not be narrowed to remote reading of images
- Commercial outsourcing is a bad (although easy) answer to solve real and often complex local/hospital radiological staff problems
- Outsourcing and commercial teleradiology companies compete with « conventional » radiology practices ; the main advantage of this competition is to wake up radiologists in order to renew their organizations

# Conclusions

- Teleradiology as a medical act (including the patient path care) is clinical medicine.
- In Europe, teleradiology should not either be considered as a e-health activity (eg patient monitoring) or be included in the e-commerce directive, as required by the European Council of Medical Orders

Telemedicine is not e-commerce !

The logo of the European Council of Medical Orders is located in the bottom right corner. It features the text "European Council Medical Orders" in a dark blue, serif font, stacked vertically. The text is set against a background of horizontal bands in light blue, white, and yellow.